

SUMMARY MINUTES

ABAG Regional Planning Committee Meeting
Wednesday, April 5, 2017
375 Beale Street, Yerba Buena Room, San Francisco, California 94105

1. CALL TO ORDER

Pradeep Gupta, Chair and Vice Mayor, City of South San Francisco, called the meeting of the Regional Planning Committee (RPC) of the Association of Bay Area Governments to order at 1:05 PM

A quorum of the committee was present.

Committee Members Present

Mark Boucher
Desley Brooks
Monica Brown
David Canepa
Kathleen Cha
Cindy Chavez
Julie Combs
Pat Eklund
Martin Engelmann

Pradeep Gupta
Scott Haggerty
Russell Hancock
Melissa Jones
Nate Miley
Karen Mitchoff
Julie Pierce
Matt Regan

Katie Rice
Carlos Romero
Al Savay

Gregory Scharff
Scott Sedgley
James P. Spering
Monica E. Wilson

Jurisdiction

BAFPAA
Councilmember, City of Oakland
Supervisor, County of Solano
Supervisor, County of San Mateo
League of Women Voters--Bay Area
Supervisor, County of Santa Clara
Councilmember, City of Santa Rosa (Vice Chair)
Councilmember, City of Novato
Deputy Executive Director of Planning, Contra
Costa Transportation Agency
Mayor, City of South San Francisco (Chair)
Supervisor, County of Alameda
President & CEO, Joint Venture Silicon Valley
Executive Director BARHII, Public Health
Supervisor, County of Alameda
Supervisor, County of Contra Costa
Councilmember, City of Clayton (ABAG President)
Senior Vice President of Public Policy, Bay Area
Council
Supervisor, County of Marin
Urban Ecology
Community & Economic Dev. Director, City of San
Carlos (BAPDA)
Mayor, City of Palo Alto
Councilmember, City of Napa
Supervisor, County of Solano
Councilmember, City of Antioch

Members Absent

Paul Campos

Tilly Chang

Jurisdiction

Senior Vice President, Government Affairs, Building
Industry Association
Executive Director, SFCTA
County of San Francisco

Diane Dillon	Supervisor, County of Napa
Karen Engel	Director of Economic and Workforce Development, Peralta Community College
Michael Lane	Policy Director, Non-Profit Housing Association of Northern California
Jeremy Madsen	Executive Director, Greenbelt Alliance
Harry Price	Mayor, City of Fairfield
David Rabbitt	Supervisor, County of Sonoma (ABAG Vice President)
Mark Ross	Councilmember, City of Martinez
Kirsten Spalding	Executive Director SMCUCA
Egon Terplan	Planning Director, SPUR
Dyan Whyte	Assist. Exc. Officer, San Francisco Regional Waterboard

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

3. APPROVAL OF REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 1, 2017

Chair Gupta recognized a motion by **Russ Hancock**, Joint Venture Silicon Valley, and seconded by **Karen Mitchoff**, Supervisor, County of Contra Costa, to approve the RPC minutes of February 1, 2017.

There was no discussion.

Yes votes were: Boucher, Brooks, Brown, Canepa, Cha, Chavez, Combs, Eklund, Engelmann, Gupta, Haggerty, Hancock, Jones, Miley, Mitchoff, Pierce, Regan, Rice, Romero, Savay, Scharff, Spering, Wilson

No votes were: none

Abstain votes were: Sedgley

Absent were: Campos, Chang, Dillon, Engel, Madsen, Price, Rabbitt, Ross, Spalding, Terplan, Whyte

4. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Gupta introduced new members:

Scott Sedgley, Councilmember, City of Napa

Kathleen Cha, League of Women Voters--Bay Area

5. SESSION OVERVIEW BY DUANE BAY, ABAG DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH

Duane Bay, Deputy Director of Planning and Research at ABAG, gave an overview of the meeting and future plans and schedules.

Chair Gupta moved the committee to Item 7.

6. HOUSING PROGRAM OVERVIEW

Information

Julie Combs, RPC Vice Chair, Housing Subcommittee Chair, **Duane Bay**, ABAG Deputy Planning and Research Director, and **Gillian Adams** ABAG Senior Regional Planner, provided an overview of the housing program, an update on the Housing Subcommittee process and a report on housing production.

Member Spering stated that it is important to have an honest discussion about the fact that the public does not want housing to be developed, even when we have sites designated for development. A couple elected officials lost the election because they approved housing. In Solano County they have sites that have been designated for development for 20 or 30 years and the public does not want it to be developed.

Every community has a responsibility to build housing for their children. The reason housing is so high is because we do not have the supply, if we can build the supply, the prices will come down. He does not mind providing housing in Solano County, but he certainly wants the investment in the transportation infrastructure. The redevelopment concept needs to be revived, if it takes State Legislation, they need to pursue that.

Member Rice asked how the region can continue to have 10 new jobs for every unit of housing. Have we had a conversation with the community about job growth? Everybody likes job growth but no one likes to build housing.

Member Combs agreed that the region has a strong interest to look to those who provide jobs to also provide housing.

Member Rice said it is fascinating how much easier it is to create a job than it is to create housing and the infrastructure to support those folks. Resiliency and shoring up our existing infrastructure is a challenge in and of itself.

Member Brown said first, when we talk about affordable housing, we need to talk about the second grade teacher, the emergency room nurse, and the county worker or city worker who wants to live in the community, so everybody gets away from another image. Second what is wrong with building a 1,000 square foot home that has three bedrooms and one bath? Third, we need to revisit Prop 13.

Member Pierce agreed with the previous comments. She does not think we can provide funding to build 100% of the new affordable housing needed. We need to look at other

approaches such as existing housing; we also need legislation to provide subsidies. We also need to get the legislation to count senior assisted care. The problem that many cities have is how to put together the specific plans ahead of development and an entitlement package. Before redevelopment went away we could put that together. She supports housing, and supports job creation where the existing housing is located. She does not support reducing the job growth because those jobs are for our kids and grandkids.

Member Engelmann said we have been meeting with ABAG staff asking for a dashboard on housing. We finally got it; he expressed his appreciation to Gillian Adams, Senior Regional Planner at ABAG, and the staff for giving us the information that tells us how we're doing. We can't figure out how well we're doing without knowing exactly where the housing is going. He hopes that ABAG continues to provide this data. We can use it in our PDA Investment and Growth Strategy reports.

Mr. Bay said the full data set will be available for anybody who wants to do analysis for their own purposes. All of the Regional Housing Need Allocation (RHNA) sites by Assessor Parcel Number (APN) and all of the housing permit locations by APN.

Member Savay said a new trend in Santa Clara and San Mateo Counties is commercial linkage fees where cities are looking at how to link new jobs to the creation of housing. It's a very strong new funding source. He asked whether the Housing Subcommittee has talked about displacement. It is a huge issue for people who are trying to create affordable housing. We don't have the expertise to help people find new housing. We need help in that regard.

Member Regan said from 2010 through 2015, eight jobs were created for every one housing unit created. In 2015 and 2016 that ratio is down to less than four and a half jobs created for every new housing unit permitted. For the first time in eight years we are losing jobs in the Bay Area. Our inability to build housing is forcing companies to leave.

Member Eklund asked are we going to be able to access the housing dashboard via the internet by the end of this month. Could you show us the database here at this meeting?

Member Combs said the Housing Subcommittee is a surprisingly fun and exciting meeting, so if housing is your interest please consider joining us. We need our housing work to continue forward through the process of merger. She proposed to Chair Gupta that he convey to the ABAG Executive Board three items: One, that the work plan and organizational structure of the integrated regional planning department reflect the importance of housing. Two, that MTC fully utilize ABAG staff expertise related to housing matters and maintain at least the current level of effort for housing programs, which would be at least four full-time equivalent staff (FTEs). Three, that for the next RHNA cycle there be a housing methodology committee including substantial local government representation, and that the ABAG Executive Board approve the RHNA methodology.

Member Eklund said the housing methodology committee is something that the ABAG Executive Board definitely needs to be talking about.

Committee members Combs, Eklund, Haggerty, Mitchoff, Pierce, Scharff, Spering and staff, Bay, Moy, and Paul discussed the need to make a motion.

Chair Gupta recognized a motion by **Julie Combs**, Councilmember, City of Santa Rosa, and seconded by **Pat Eklund**, Councilmember, City of Novato, to convey to the ABAG Executive Board three items:

1. The work plan and organizational structure of the integrated regional planning department should reflect the importance of housing.
2. MTC should fully utilize ABAG staff expertise related to housing matters and maintain at least the current level of effort for housing programs, which would be at least four full-time equivalent staff (FTEs).
3. For the next RHNA cycle there should be a housing methodology committee including substantial local government representation, and that the ABAG Executive Board approves the RHNA methodology.

Yes votes were: Brown, Cha, Chavez, Combs, Eklund, Rice, Romero.

No votes were: Boucher, Brooks, Canepa, Engelmann, Haggerty, Hancock, Miley, Mitchoff, Pierce, Savay, Scharff, Sedgley, Wilson.

Abstain votes were: Jones, Regan.

Absent were: Campos, Chang, Dillon, Engel, Lane, Madsen, Price, Rabbitt, Ross, Spalding, Spering, Terplan, Whyte.

The motion did not pass.

Chair Gupta moved the Committee to Item 8.

7. PLAN BAY AREA - ACTION PLAN

Information

Ken Kirkey, Director of Planning at MTC, **Matt Maloney**, MTC, **Kristen Villanueva**, MTC, and **Mark Shorett**, ABAG, presented a draft Plan Bay Area action plan.

Member Boucher said that when we talk about resilience or road maintenance, we have to ensure we consider maintenance of all of the utilities that are located in roadways, such as gas and electric underground, sewer and groundwater.

Mr. Maloney agreed that they certainly will work on that.

Member Cha asked which community-based organizations were part of the outreach meetings and whether staff could provide a way to show how suggestions are going to be integrated into the final plan.

Mr. Maloney answered that the forecasted development pattern and the transportation investment strategy were already adopted. MTC does work with community-based organizations, including the Rose foundation and others.

Mr. Kirkey responded that the community-based organizations are tied to Communities of Concern. Typically, low-income areas with a high percentage of non-white residents, are under-served in terms of outreach related to language. We are working with the Rose Foundation and Chinese and Mandarin radio station, a group in Hayward and a group in Concord.

Member Cha replied that the selection process of the community-based organizations need to be explained for folks to understand.

Member Regan said we had a discussion in a previous RPC meeting about Priority Production Areas (PPAs), a motion was made by Member Madsen, Greenbelt Alliance, to move PPAs as a discussion item to MTC with a very strong note attached that PPAs should potentially be subordinate to housing interests given the nature of the housing crisis in the Bay Area. He would like to have the minutes checked of the previous RPC meeting to make sure that this is reflective of what was actually voted on and decided upon at that meeting. PPAs could potentially give jurisdictions, which are not supportive of adding housing, another regulatory tool to say housing land's off the table because the area is in a PPA. Also, at the Housing Sub-Committee today, ABAG and MTC staff presented some of the most forward thinking, progressive housing principles he has seen in a long time from a public agency, and he is really looking forward to working with MTC and ABAG staff together.

Mr. Kirkey said the Action Plan is a Draft and all items will be discussed further among the Executive Board and the MTC Commission. Housing is central to what the agencies are doing and to the Integrated Regional Planning Program.

Member Eklund asked why neither the RPC nor the ABAG delegates and alternates in each city, were engaged in the discussion of the Action Plan?

Mr. Maloney said they could not include RPC and ABAG delegates because constrained schedule, instead they focused on the Regional Advisory Working Group (RAWG) which is a very open group.

Member Eklund said those are MTC's advisory groups, no ABAG advisory groups were engaged. She asked if ABAG and MTC are going to have a draft staff report, slide show and staff available to cities to bring to the City Council Meeting about Plan Bay Area 2040?

Mr. Kirkey said they have materials available for all the cities to access the plan. There are not going to be individualized PowerPoint presentations.

Member Eklund said on housing actions, you mentioned Congestion Management Agencies (CMAs). ABAG delegates and alternates in each of the counties should be

listed as well because CMAs do not deal with housing, you are leaving the ABAG side out of the Action Plan.

Mr. Paul said when we have primarily ABAG staff saying anything about outreach, the first group we connect with is the RPC. We think about the ABAG delegates because that is what we do, and often do not include the CMAs. Going forward we will have a much fuller outreach program with ABAG and MTC combined.

Member Eklund said you just confirmed that this has been written by MTC staff and RPC did not have any input.

Matt Maloney said the document was written by Mark Shorett from ABAG, it was a cooperative effort among the two staffs.

Member Romero is concerned about three big problems: Housing plus transportation, displacement, and access to jobs. Those issues are a critical foundation to ensure that we have a functional and equitable Bay Area.

Mr. Kirkey said we have an Action Plan precisely because of the reasons you outlined. The Action Plan was directed and voted on as part of ABAG Executive Board and MTC Commission approval. They are seeking more input through this process this spring.

Chair Gupta moved the Committee to Item 6.

8. ABAG/MTC STAFF CONSOLIDATION

Information

Brad Paul, ABAG Acting Executive Director, provided an overview of the staff consolidation process to date.

Member Cha suggested convening a meeting of ABAG retirees to talk about their concerns.

Mr. Paul said the Implementation Action Plan for option seven calls for a meeting with the retirees; they will have the meeting as soon as they can.

Member Eklund asked for the names of the ABAG staff that are on the housing and regional planning teams.

Mr. Paul replied that the housing and neighborhood team is Adams, Chan, Leffall, and Shorett, and on the regional planning policy, Bullock, Brechwald and Germeraad.

Chair Gupta said he has been part of this staff consolidation and everybody has been extremely cooperative.

Member Romero said he is looking at who is leading housing and neighborhoods, the most senior person with over 30 years of work in housing is Duane Bay, Deputy

Planning Director at ABAG; he is curious why he was assigned to CASA and not overseeing housing and neighborhoods. He also asked how the ABAG Subcommittees and the discussions that occurred at the General Assembly reflected in this integration of staff? He mentioned the example of how Steve Heminger, Executive Director at MTC, reduced input into the MTC process: three committees were combined into one Policy Advisory Group. His fear is that ABAG will be folded into an ineffective group. ABAG is losing staff and he wants to know how these bodies will either continue to exist, or if they are not going to exist, to know today.

Mr. Paul said this concern has been raised by the Ad Hoc Committees. Leah Zippert, Senior Communications Officer at ABAG, and Halimah Anderson, Communications Officer at ABAG, are working with our delegates to the General Assembly, and they will continue their work under Randy Rentschler, Deputy Executive Director of Operations at MTC who works with Alix Bockelman, Deputy Executive Director of Policy at MTC. They are working together to hardwire these issues in the Contract for Services, the MOU, and the Budget and Work Plan for 2017-18.

Member Romero said it would be helpful to see an organization chart that flows into these activities that ABAG has as to who is staffing them. If ABAG has no staff and cannot direct anyone to work on the Sub-Committees then it is a paper.

Member Pierce said you can say ABAG has no staff or you can say ABAG now has three times the staff. She does not look at this as a loss, she sees a gain. They are incorporating all the specific tasks of the planning department into the Budget and Work Plan.

Member Romero said he does not see any direct line of authority that ABAG has to any staff. Mr. Heminger has all the discretion to decide and say "that a particular committee is not relevant to the work that ABAG was doing." The ABAG Executive Board does not hire or fire Mr. Heminger so he does not have to agree to what the Board decides to do. Having some ability to influence where the staff are deployed in terms of programs that we want, and memorialized in some document would be helpful.

Chair Gupta said in the Draft Budget and Work Plan, it does include committees and sub-committees specifically as part of the work that needs to be done under the contract by MTC.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Vice Chair Combs adjourned the Regional Planning Committee at 2:55 PM

The next meeting of the Regional Planning Committee will be on April 5, 2017.

Submitted:

Wally Charles

Date: April 25, 2017

For information or to review audio recordings of ABAG Regional Planning Committee meetings, contact Wally Charles at 415.820.7993 or info@abag.ca.gov.